

WEST HARBOUR - JAMES STREET PLAZA PUBLIC ART PROJECT



Public Consultation Results

The following are a list of the comments and preferred selections provided by members of the public during consultation both online at the City of Hamilton website and at the Williams Fresh Cafe – Waterfront (47 Discovery Drive) from November 4 to 24, 2019. Thank you to those who have provided their comments thus far. Public consultation will continue until November 24, 2019.

***All Our Relations*, Artist: Angela DeMontigny**

- Perhaps we could also recognize the name/history of the First Nations land that we are standing on.
- Angela's artwork depicts what the harbour and surrounding area was like before industrialization took over the landscape of Hamilton Bay. All aspects of her renderings show what is important to our ecosystem.
- I like the fact it refers to beginnings as a country and city. I am not native but feel we must recognize the first people.
- *All Our Relations* – a reminder that we are all connected – past and present – we need to work to remove our “most incidents of hate crime” Title.
- *All Our Relations*
- *All Our Relations*
- This model / concept brings colour to the square, colours which will change with the day and seasons.
- This piece contains the colour, vibrancy and beauty that Hamilton's Bayfront should highlight. It is timeless and elegant.
My only worry is that it is not large enough to attract tourists.
- *All Our Relations*



- Nice clean looking colourful sculpture.
- Colourful
Lots of images incorporated in the design – leads to promoting conservation
Reduces risk of children climbing on it unlike some of the other proposals
- A few different pieces
Culturally relevant art
Colourful and fun
Sturdy
Tells a story
Leads to conversation
- The CONCEPT is strongest and speaks to Hamilton's need to reconnect to our FIRST NATIONS history. She's made choices that make this the strongest piece conceptually. *All Around* we're reminded of our impact on the earth, and this installation says "We're all connected, and we've been saying so all along."
The VISUAL is the strongest too. The coloured glass beads will shine brilliantly even in the medium to low sunlight. This piece will be a destination. I can't wait to see it installed here at Bayfront! Choose it! 😊
Thirdly, it's the most loving, honest, peace-making of the choices. This piece presents a chance to further the work of reconciliation between First Nations peoples and the majority culture. What a powerful piece it'll be, and how it'll bring people together if / when it's installed. In other words, this piece is NEEDED & HELPFUL.
I'm so impressed and moved by this installation – please pass on my appreciation to the artist 😊 (I don't know nor have I heard of her)
One of the criteria I considered in this decision was: "which piece could only work here? At HAMILTON'S Bayfront? "Through that lens, it seemed that the other pieces could work just as well as a shopping mall in Oakville, inside a museum, etc. *ALL OUR RELATIONS* seems suitable for this place at this time and I strongly urge you to consider it on that basis.
Thanks for reading!
- *All Our Relations*. It is a stunningly beautiful and poignant design! I couldn't think of something more perfectly appropriate in line with the goal of the project.
- Angela DeMontigny's installation is not only beautiful, it is an all-encompassing representation of all the elements of nature intrinsic to all living things. As a Hamilton resident, Angela is immersed in Hamilton culture and is a key influence in the community. The gorgeous glass orbs will sparkle radiantly, drawing the viewers eyes to the myriad of images, colours, and artistic expression of nature and life, interdependent upon one another.
Her enthusiasm, spirit and character are excellent representations of our wonderful city and she is an inspiration to all of us. Her heart and soul are in this installation and I cannot wait to see it displayed proudly on Hamilton's waterfront!

- *All our Relations*. Love concept and overall appeal and the story it has to tell.
- The colours, symbolism and creativity of the *All Our Relations* submission is truly inspiring. I can already imagine the colours reflecting around it as the sun ashes through catching the attention of adults and children alike.
Although more of a literal interpretation, the beauty of the piece is truly reflective of the colourful history and contributions of our community.
- I think the Angela Demontigny- *All our Relations* fits all the goals and themes listed. It is very pretty and also represents our Indigenous People really well. Each portrait has great meaning and detail and especially showers great connections to the water.
- Angela Demontigny's submission is beautiful. The inclusion of colour and the way it would incorporate light is wonderful.
So many of the other submissions would frankly be a horrible eyesore. I am baffled that they have made it through the selection process to this point.
Please please please don't Mar the waterfront with weird hydro tower clouds or giant swans.
- I like the simplicity mixed with dynamic structure of *All Our Relations*. It's flows like our world, leaves space to see the landscape and resonates beauty of the outdoors.
- Definitely *All Our Relations*!
What an amazing concept for expressing information so valuable to Hamilton's past, present and future. The tall steel structures will have an amazing presence on the waterfront and each represents important educational stories for all ages. Imagine the light shining through all of those glass beads casting colorful shadows on the walkways. This will be public art at its finest: historical, educational, and beautiful!
- I love "*All Our Relations*" by Angela Demontigny.
I like its connection to nature and indigenous stories. I think it is a thoughtful and beautiful idea which will catch the light and connect you to the waterfront.
- The work of Angela Demontigny hits the goals and theme, and is a perfect fit for the location.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY's *All Our Relations* beautifully foregrounds the Indigenous spirit of the land and our connections with the Dish with One Spoon covenant, while at the same time integrating artistic elements with the surrounding landscape. I believe this is the most appropriate for the site because of the integration of water and nature elements, reference to Indigenous beading practices, the importance of Reconciliation and the need to foreground Indigenous culture.
- Angela DeMontigny

- *All Our Relations* is my preference so we can showcase an indigenous artist
- "*All Our Relations*" is the most visually pleasing, and adds to the site without overwhelming the natural beauty of the harbour. It also has the strongest connection to the natural landscape and provides reminders of the ecosystems that form part of the harbour and need to be protected. The connection to the local indigenous peoples is a very important concept in this day and age, and I think as a society we should embrace that as much as possible.
- *All Our Relations* is the best looking and most functional looking art structure. The rest are too aggressive and the tower could be liable for injuries as the other structures could be easily climbed on and damaged by public pedestrians. You do not want art structures that create an obstruction within public squares. Even though you could create a more interactive structure it could cause problems in the future. It's best to stick with a simple, safe and beautiful structure like *All Our Relations* that could withstand the harbours environment.
- Hi there and thank you so much for coming forth and providing the "shortlist" of the artists for this wonderful project. ANGELA DEMONTIGNY, *All Our Relations* is my personal favourite, as the art work has multiple, colourful pieces that bring many images of water and life to light. The other pieces are quite frankly not attractive at all... and would not add anything to the area. They are too plain, or look like a mess. I don't get the swans at all... they are not nicely shaped. The boat looks too messy.. The fountain is a close second, but also runs the risk of being too busy/messy looking... I don't get "Two Smiths" whatsoever.. not attractive... and the Cloud Tower looks very strange..
- I think the "*All Our Relations*" is the best proposal because it is a blank canvas (or could be). It could allow local inspired art be incorporated as well as indigenous-type art. The *Trumpeter*, *Cloud Tower* and even the not-displayed proposals are too abstract for this area ... they would not be received well.
The *Fountain* is good, but is too simple and should include an element of action or actually have a water feature.
 - 1- *All our Relations*
 - 2- *The Harbour Boat*
 - 3- *Fountain*
 - 4- *Ship Shape*
 - 5- *Echo of the Trumpeter* – NO
 - 6- *Cloud Tower* - NO
- I chose ANGELA DEMONTIGNY
All Our Relations as my favorite based on what I find to hold the most meaning with its representation of the First Nations valued of Nature, whenever I'm out in the city of Hamilton it is always Colour that attracts my eye regardless of how much time I'm spending observing displays of artwork or architecture if there is a use of colour then it's bringing something of joy to me as a pedestrian or passenger. I really enjoy Angela's idea for the

glass panels and colour bead like design it's a visual reminder of what it means to be Canadian without the terrible history aspects it's a reminder of the unity of all living beings and In my opinion that is something all people can relate to for generations past, present and future.

- I like Angela's submission.
- Angela Demontigny - *All Our Relations*, gets my vote. The message is important - cherish and protect nature and ancestral lands.
- Angela Demontigney. Reflects the past and present of the landscape, is visually compelling, will be approachable to many age groups and backgrounds. It feels like a great balance between art and design that will age well
- Angela DeMontigney piece is the most engaging visually and culturally. If it is not already included in the plan, I would like to see informational/ educational plaques attached to each stand explaining the symbols and stories.
- All our Relations by Angela Demontigny
- Demontigny's 'All our relations' is the only piece, in my opinion, that really speaks to the human-nature connection. Give us something beautiful to look at, not abstract.
- I think "*all our relations*" is good as it would form a visible beacon and provides a reconnection to our waters-edge while paying tribute to our indigenous community and provides some sort of environmental awareness.
- I personally like how "All our Relations" reflects our interdependence on our natural world and at a time of Reconciliation I believe these teachings speak loudly to us all The beading technique will be beautiful in the sun at the pier
- I vote for *All Our Relations*. It's beautiful artwork and I feel that the story it tells would be a unique draw for the waterfront.
- *All our Relations* gets my vote. It is beautiful and thoughtful
- *All our Relations*. Would make a wonderful addition. We need more First Nations Art throughout Hamilton. A Great Representation of Mother Earth and how she takes care of all of Humanity.
- *All Our Relations*, should be considered for this public art. The colors and design will draw people in, the stories will engage and the light shining through the glass beads will change through the day. The art will leave a positive feeling of connection with our history, water, nature, recreational and industrial elements of our city.

- Angela Demontigny's final glass piece looks like a good transition from the conceptual drawings.
- We love the *All Our Relations* design it is Beautiful to look at and very pleasant to the eyes because of all the colorful pictures and design. Very meaningful rendering of nature and historic connection to the universe. I feel it's the most peaceful and loving design and the City would be proud to display this piece of art.
- *All Our Relations* gives priority to the keepers of our land and water. It highlights the longest lineage of human relationship with the harbour, and does so in a visually arresting way. By spreading the installation over several panels, the viewer is invited to step into the installation and interact with its relationship to place. Promoting Indigenous art in public spaces is just a small part of the reconciliation work we need to do as settlers.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY
- I think Angela's proposal, *All Our Relations*, captures the goal and themes best. Love the colours, the design elements, the celebratory aspect and mostly the way it connects us with the past and compels us to think about that connection in ways that have future meaning. A really solid proposal. Would enjoy seeing those panels at our waterfront!
- I think Angela DeMontigny has offered a valuable insight into the history of this place. It would be an invaluable place for educators to visit, for art classes, indigenous studies classes, social studies classes, etc to visit.
In this age of learning and reconciliation, it's important to have art that educates, as well as enhances a space.
- I would love to see "*All Our Relations*" be chosen for the site. The beads and glass are reminiscent of light and colour that draw all forms of life to the water's edge. Water is essential to life. The nature of glass, light, and forms made of 'beads' immediately delights the senses and uplifts the spirits (and eyes!) of adults, children, and visitors to the Harbour. It's important for public art to reflect the nature of a place, to be meaningful both those who know and love the Harbour and its ecosystem, but also for visitors. You don't have to speak English or know anything about Indigenous art or culture to relate to the flash of colour seen from near or afar of glass with the light of the sky streaming through. You don't have to understand the deeper cultural significance of intertwined animals, birds, elements, and spiritual beings, to the enjoy their beauty. After centuries of 'cultural genocide' and the attempted erasure of Indigenous culture, the re-connection to Indigenous culture and art, in this case, beadwork, is deeply meaningful. But you don't have to know any of that to relate to the figural, watery language of the pieces. The light and colour of the glass and their elevation celebrates the art of beadwork, but jumps genres to become architectural fashion. At its heart, "*All My Relations*" is a celebration of the diversity of life--human and non-human--of our deep connection to "all our relations", and the magical places where land meets water. Angela DeMontigny has a proven track record as an artist and designer in the

high-pressure world of fashion design. Her work as a fashion designer has inspired her to create 'sky cloth' for the beadwork on sculptural forms that is unique.

- I love Angela DeMontigny's rendering! Well thought out. Rich meaning. Artistically appealing! This has my vote!
- Angela DeMontigny's "*All our Relations*" adds a beautiful dimension to the Indigenous lenses she is overlaying onto the site. There's a clarity, an honouring, and a way forward contained in this work. I love the use of light, colour, iron and glass to tell this story. Absolutely an inviting and welcoming installation bringing past, present, and future together. Love it!!
- "*All my relations*" submission by Angela DeMontigny is by far the best choice and winner for this project. It is beautiful Art, a powerful statement and would also support the work of local glassblower Paull Rodrigue. This picturesque exhibition meets the City of Hamilton's objectives, focuses on the gift of life, mother earth, indigenous culture and would be a beautiful popular attraction site. Additionally, when the sun will shine through the coloured glass beads, the reflections give light and warmth creating patterns that will be both visually striking and vibrant. On days with no sunlight, the coloured glass beads will still glow and show off its illuminated artwork.
- I believe that Angela Demontigny's proposal, "*All My Relations*" is the best choice for the space and goals of the project. It provides beauty and value without dominating the space, as some of the other proposals do. It adds to enjoyment of the waterfront, rather than deflecting attention away from it, as some of the others do. It is the only proposal that contributes color, and that beautifully lit with sunlight due to its being transparent glass. Its themes and values are easily accessible to all ages and nations, while promoting a Native American value of harmonious relations and sustainability with the environment.
- *All our relations* is my choice.
I think it is highly relevant because it speaks to the Indigenous connection to the land and the area; because the lakeshore is highly important for migrating wildlife, particularly in the face of climate change; and because it will teach children about how we are all interrelated and the importance of nature, in an intuitive way.
- 1) *All Our Relations* – it is pretty takes up less “public” space
2) Echo of the Trumpeter
3) The Harbour Boat
The *Cloud Tower* looks like a water tower
- My first vote would be for ANGELA DEMONTIGNY. Not only is she from the city but was should be representing local indigenous artists. My second NICHOLAS CROMBACH - because he is a young emerging artist located in the GTHA.

- I like *ALL OUR RELATIONS* the best. It will provide colour throughout the year and good vertical images. The link to our past should be celebrated and this art installation will do that.
SHIP SHAPE is my second choice. Modern, clean lines, visible and interesting.
ECHO OF THE TRUMPETER is also very good but I wonder if the sculptures will 'age' well - would they become dingy in a short period of time?
CLOUD TOWER should NOT be installed. It looks cheap and I don't think it is very relatable in a good way at all. Towers on the Beach Strip are necessary but are they beautiful and do we need more of "them"? No!
- I was engaged with the submissions from: *ERNEST DAETWYLER*, *ANGELA DEMONTIGNY*, *FIGUREGROUND STUDIO* and *BRANDON VICKERD* on the basis of art production and creativity. But - I place *Angela Demontigny's* submission on a higher level of importance for this particular public site because of the much needed educational communication component of our area's cultural history which is tens of thousands of years old. The experience of viewing the natural beauty of the harbour lands and water-scapes with the artistic reminder of the rich cultural ties to this land and water is crucial to our understanding of who and where we are.
- Our top choice is *Demontigny's* work, which honours the Haudenosaunee past and offers a thanksgiving address for the current reconnection to the water and earth. Her five panels offer various viewers different kinds of images to enjoy. The other works are more single-image works and so offer less entry points for different kinds of viewers. We also think the scale of her work is impressive and will impress visitors. Our second choice is *Daetwyler's boat*, which brings together the past of driftwood into the present of shipping, voyage, and dreaming.
- This is very different and connects with the indigenous culture. I like the colours and transparency of glass. There is not enough indigenous art in Hamilton.
- Love the connection to history and the present. Think it would look lovely with the sun shining through the art pieces.
All the submissions were impressive, shout out to the *Cloud Tower* – it has whimsy and a large visual presence combined with an important reminder of the importance of the water cycle.
- Representation of indigenous art. Multiple story lines representing human relationship to nature at the shoreline. Beautiful and innovative design. Legible from afar.
- In my opinion the "*All Our Relations*" exhibit is the most suitable
- *Angela Demontigny* is my favourite. Pieces are colourful and bright. Other seem to cool for this area. Love the culture of course, it is long overdue for more of Hamilton to recognize our history and who was here first.

- I like the idea of a colourful, image-based public art piece at the entrance off of James St. Many of the options seem to be so minimal with no story being told. *All Our Relations* has a beautiful connection to Indigenous history, symbolism and the water. And what a cool idea to use large, colourful glass beads. I think this would look fantastic!
- *All our Relations* is the most beautiful Art design and one that relates with all types of people and is decorative and appealing to look at bring the nature to life. This design is also easy to understand the concept of nature at is best. It is something that you can admire and enjoy and be proud to show the world because it would be unique.
- All of these are worthy and interesting. I loved the *swan* proposal best until I noticed that they're half swan/half boat! I find that a bit creepy. I wish they were just giant swans without the other concept.
I love the *DeMontigny* one because we SO need to honour traditional residents of this land - I just wish it were a bit less flat and one dimensional.
Daetwyler's *boat* is cool but I don't think that's the right spot for it.
I like *fountain* but it's a bit like the other one down by Williams.
So I might choose *2 Smiths*.
I DON'T like the *cloud tower* for this project - at all. For a museum maybe.
If I have to choose one of these I'd choose: *DeMontigny's* panels
- It shows the different colours you see in the water, nature and industry.
- *All Our Relations* - I like this one
Ship Shape and *Fountain* – same theme with sailboat
- Each installment provides an opportunity to reflect on the City's connection to nature and how it is interwoven in our history and daily lives. Although not something described by the artist, the colourful installments also allude to the cultural diversity of our great city.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY
ALL OUR RELATIONS
The work will be colourful allowing for easy visibility and it recalls an important aspect of the city's historic connection with water and nature. It speaks to connection and coming together, which I find to be very strong.
- While I like *Fountain* and *Ship Shape*, they seem too literal. The materials for *the Harbour Boat* seem too nostalgic and out of place in relation to the project's goals and themes. The *Echo of the Trumpeter* is interesting conceptually, but it would be difficult for it to achieve its goal of elegance. *All Our Relations* seems to me the best in its integration of themes, while bringing in a rich history that most of us would like to know more about, but which is often hidden in our city's landscape.

- *All Our Relations* by Angela Demontigny is my choice. Why? We live on Indigenous land that we have not yet acknowledged. This art installation, in a small way, redresses our oversight. The art installation itself speaks to the wholeness of our world; that all is connected. Angela's description of each panel and significance would be an excellent primer on how we can interpret the natural world around us. The panels allow us to peer through them but also see the individual pieces that symbolize the four elements. The simplicity is deceiving. It would provide the viewer with something new each time they encountered it.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY is an artist of connection. This work spoke to me as soon as I saw it. Absolutely beautiful. Her words reinforce that feeling for me. I look forward to see her artwork. Hers is the only work which encompasses your Goal and Themes. Thank you for listening.
- *All Our Relations* is far and away the best choice for the city. It incorporates the goals of including history, water and the natural world. But it goes further by acknowledging the history and art of the people here before Europeans. For a city with a street and a college named Mohawk not nearly enough is done to recognize that aspect of the past and the present within this city. The art is also the most beautiful of the choices and has the most positive energy. It will appeal to all ages and cultures.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY - *ALL OUR RELATIONS*
I think this installation will be beautiful in all seasons and represents an important step towards Truth and Reconciliation as we recognize the that live off of and the important history that comes with the land.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY- *All my relations* would provide a serene, reflective space to the waterfront. Each panel links us to our environment with thoughtful consideration to the land and ecosystem around Hamilton. It reminds us of how we are interconnected with the water, land and animals of this area. It is a beautiful piece.
- ANGELA DEMONTIGNY - *ALL OUR RELATIONS*
The renderings of these proposed pieces are absolutely beautiful. The details and colors will be stunning. The stories and messages they convey are so critical at this time. Indigenous teachings should be celebrated and this art is one way to do this. This piece seems to be the most meaningful to me as it connects to the water, animals, plants, people before us and working together and learning how to grow a respectful community.
- *All Our Relations* is my #1 choice, with *The Harbour Boat* #2. Others lack theme and context. *Cloud Tower* could be mis-interpreted as turd on a tower, given the sewage spill. Ship Shape and Fountain may invite vandalism and may be subject to noise and fatigue fractures due to wind.

- *All Our Relations* (by Angela Demontigny) is, for me, the proposal that achieves the project's goals of
 - visibility/being a beacon/marketing the entrance to the West Harbour,
 - interlating the city's history with water and the natural world
 while being (of all the proposals, in my opinion) the most aesthetically distinctive and pleasing. It is a pictorial gateway, referencing and celebrating the city's history and pre-history. Of all the sculptures, this is the one I would most welcome seeing again and again.
- *All our relations* is gorgeous!! It shows the various elements and creatures to nature and stands tall for all to see. I also truly appreciate the native wheel for their way is truly harmonious with nature.

Cloud Tower, Artist: Brandon Vickerd

- Brandon Vickerd *Cloud Tower* - seems the best for the location as easiest seen looking down James Street
- Brandon Vickerd - *Cloud Tower*
- Brandon Vickers work is a literally a cloud above all of the others. *Cloud Tower's* scale makes it a modern art beacon in the harbour. Brandon Vickers' work excels at combining industrial and the environmental themes. Congratulations on an iconic sculpture for Hamilton!
- Brandon Vickerd. It's something that everyone of all ages can appreciate. It makes you look up. Dream about the future.
- Thank you for involving the public over this important decision. I'm completely blown away by the skill and passion of these incredible artists. I'm sure the others that weren't chosen are just as incredible and passionate
It's a tough choice. I like all concepts from the shortlisted. The one that resonates most with me is Brandon Vickerd's *Cloud Tower*. The combination of materials paying homage to Hamilton's history with the connection to nature represented by the cloud above is a unique representation and serves as a point of reference. I like the idea of having a landmark to reference. I can relate to this from my years traveling and meeting friends in a foreign country.
- I believe the *Cloud Tower* is the best option, as the visible beacon (as mentioned in the proposal). I think it will inspire a better connection to this area and it's height is really something that will make this piece really stand out.
My second vote would be for the *Fountain*, as it also is large enough to create a space around it and draw visual connections.

- After carefully considering every option, I feel as though *Cloud Tower* would be the best choice.
Of all the proposed works it is the one that I would be most excited to see and to tell folks from out of town about.
There's a lot of artistic merit here as well, in my opinion. The size is significant, the statement plays well and it's provocative in how unexpected it is. I really hope this piece wins.
I think *Angela Montigny's* piece requires serious consideration and I do wish there was more public art by Aboriginal artists here in Hamilton, but I find the submission a bit literal to the theme and frankly, not as exciting or provocative as *Cloud Tower* as a piece of public art.
Echo of the trumpeter is clever, though a bit obtuse and represents one of the less exciting parts of the waterfront, which is unruly swans and people feeding them.
Two Smiths and *Figureground Studio* are predictable and similar to a lot of other public art everyone has already seen. On a practical note, I think they'd be hard to photograph for selfies and will suffer from low public engagement.
The Harbour Boat would feel like recycled art. It's run its course at Mac. It's a great piece, but not made with this particular project in mind and many people like myself have already seen it. This would feel like a total mail-in.
An exciting spot for a public installation!
- The *cloud tower* is my pick! The combination of Hamilton's industrial aspect and the importance of protecting our waterways symbolized by the cloud is a perfect combination to represent this area of the city.
- I like the height and thus making a highly markation of the entrance.
- Vickerds piece is the only one to bring humour and whimsy to the site. Abstract sculptures, like many of the others, feel like work bought to fulfill Toronto's public art requirement for new developments.
- I would love to see Brandon Vickerd's work selected as I feel its height and visibility function best as a "beacon" and it provides an aesthetically interesting and pleasing commentary on the interplay between nature and humanity.
- The most interesting project in my view is *Cloud Tower* by Brandon Vickerd. It is truly monumental and can be see from afar while also being structurally sound and able to withstand the elements including wind. It is humorous while also relating to its surroundings and will become a destination for travellers as well as residents of Hamilton.
- B. Vickerd's work is good. It offers a playful response to Hamilton iconic industrial skyline and the geographic characteristics of the Bayfront/harbour's environmental conditions. And! It's pretty great that it serves as a landmark- a light house- that guides land travelers towards the coast

Echo of the Trumpeter, Artist: Nicolas Crombach

- It reminds me of all the birds at the harbour. Kids can sit in it – very interactive.
- Very difficult to choose one they are all so good. Each one represents an aspect of the Pier. The Swans are a reflection of the wildlife. The people reflect the trail, walk and the cycle community.
- Reflects interaction between nature and leisure at the harbour. Playful and interactive.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
- The connection to wildlife
- I find Nicholas Crombach's swan proposal to be a really thought-provoking, playful and engaging approach! I think it will excite visitors to this West Harbour plaza!
- I like the whimsical and engaging swan boat proposal by Nicholas Crombach. It will appeal to adults and children alike.
It is more approachable in content and in form.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
I love how this work fits into the water front setting - which itself is quite magical - and so unexpected in a city most often recognized as an industrial centre.
I was born in Hamilton, given up for adoption and returned to Hamilton 15 years ago. The first time I've seen trumpeter swans migrating, the dead of night, in moonlight, was when I came back home. I was lucky enough to see them again several years later. This piece resonates with me for that reason. And it is simply gorgeous.
- I select Nicholas Crombach 's *Swans*
His theme fulfills the call for proposals as it is sensual as well as thoughtful
It will appeal to children in its fairy tale quality as well as to adults who know the history. A teaching moment.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter* is a connection between waterfront play and real swans at a scale that will be enjoyable to photograph and experience.
I love the story of the swans coming back from the brink of extinction
- I think *Echo of the trumpeter* is the best choice. It mirrors the local extinction of the harbour front from public life, and ultimate return as the Trumpeter Swan has now returned from expiration. Both beautify the landscape with the efforts taken to restore the land, its inhabitants.
- *Echo of the trumpeter*

- Nicholas Crombach
Unique + amazing. Address both changing times + environmental concerns. It's fantastic. Not boring in any way.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter* best reflects the project's goals and themes. Visually, it's the most striking of all the submissions. The interface between human activity and nature is beautifully highlighted with the swans being part pedal boat, and interspersed with human silhouettes. The fact that humans can have a negative and positive impact on nature is poignantly illustrated with the story of the swan almost driven to extinction by human activity, and then triumphantly brought back to healthy levels by human conservation efforts. The artist has managed to capture all this in the display, and is definitely deserving of being the winning entry.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
Reason: Unique, child friendly, true land mark
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
We love to walk the shores along the bay looking for the swans. For me the swans symbolize Hamilton; the ugly duckling growing into a beautiful swan.
- What better way to reflect the waterfront! This is beautiful and will really attract admirers. Simplistic beauty. The essence of the harbour. Love it!
- *Echo of the Trumpeter*
- "*Echo of the Trumpeter*". I like that piece because it is different from the other traditional corporate looking pieces. The swans are coming to life and everyone remembers riding the swan water rides during the summer fairs. Happy memories. Its creative and whimsical and would certain catch my eye long enough to think about it and pause to enjoy it while out walking. Perfect location for that piece as we are on the waterfront where these birds actually live. If its interactive and kids can climb it that would be a bonus.
- I like the swan representation as you see them in the water, and they are beautiful.
- Crombach's, *Echo of the Trumpeter*, is the piece in which I think best reflects the goals of this public art project.
The piece looks well designed, strong materials, connects to the water, embraces life that thrives with water. It is also aesthetically pleasing, which is refreshing.
- I love Nicholas Crombach's proposal - *Echo of the Trumpeter*. He's portrayed a mix of fun/playfulness and drama and brings an element of the history of this native swan. I think it would be a beautiful and meaningful addition to the location.

- NICHILAS CROMBAC'S piece is a beautiful reminder of the delicate balance of nature and human influence, as well as nature's power and splendor. And what a fun interactive idea for children and nostalgia adults. Also, maybe Sean pedal boats could be rented there for the public!
- *Echo of the trumpeter*. Swans are a quintessential part of Hamilton's waterfront
- Nicholas Crombach's work is my pick! I love the mood and feeling that his content provides. Gentle, strong swans, by the water, with relaxed pedestrians strolling by. A blend of life, where nature is presented strongly, yet with a soft whimsical bit of fantasy. Love it!!
- Am quite thrilled by *Echo of The Trumpeter*. Multi-layered in originality and significance, linking past and present and brings us in close to its artistic intimacy in its own right. Beautiful. Thoughtful.
- The Trumpeter Swan was rehabilitated back to Ontario in the 1980's. There are presently just over 2,000 birds reported in Ontario at present. Lasalle park is a huge wintering area for these precious birds and honouring them at your library would certainly help to establish their value to the general public.
- I think Nicholas Crombach's proposal perfectly reflects the call for the submission. I love the the scale of the swans to the figures and that they look so alive. Swan 'boats' reminds me of the use of boats in the space, but also the fun aspect of family time. The contrast in scale between the human figures and the birds also brings to mind our 'smallness' in comparison to nature's vastness.
- I love Nicholas Crombach's whimsical, interactive swans. I can see them in place with people climbing into the most accessible one to take selfies with the new James street plaza featured providing lots of promotion for the area. The sculptures are alive, not sterile like the others.
- I like *Echo of the Trumpeter*. It so connects at the human level and speaks to the nature in the harbour. One summer I went down to the waterfront several times when the swans were sitting on their eggs/babies. I was not alone. Many people were clearly there every day watching and waiting. Many took their young children to join in the special experience. A true celebration of the human/animal bond.

Fountain, Artist: Figureground Studio

- It is the only piece I find to be stirring and impressive. It has the grand scale suitable for the waterfront.

- Most visually effective
- It looks vibrant and spectacular
- *Fountain*
- *Fountain*
- *Fountain*
- Like the look of the design. Easier to maintain. Reflects the connection to water.
- Artistic and beautiful!
- *Fountain*
- Very impressive. Artistic. Makes a statement. Can't miss it. Gives a feeling of freedom. Just beautiful.
- Most impressive! Artistic, Beautiful!
- For me, it is without a doubt, the *Fountain*. I am not an art connoisseur by any means but I know what I like and what speaks to me.
I would love nothing better than to be strolling along the Bayfront and see this magnificent sculpture. It reminds me that our city and indeed most of our industry is dependent on water and the big ships that carry goods to and from Hamilton.
I believe it is a real plus for our city and our Bayfront and as the artist says, it will also be a beacon for anyone approaching Hamilton by boat.
I looked hard at the other five proposals and they all paled in comparison.
- I prefer the *Fountain* proposal as I think that it recalls the Gore park fountain and its role in Hamilton history and I can see it as a place people might choose to stroll through, but also to get their wedding photos done at.
- It's a tough call, but I think *Fountain* makes the best statement -- free, unified, large enough to be seen from far away, fun, evocative of water and play.
Other notes:
Echo of the Trumpeter: If they had been representations of real swans it would have been intriguing, but swans as pedal boats coming alive -- awkward and unappealing.
The Harbour Boat: Nice concept. The driftwood version at McMaster U. is very engaging.
All Our Relations: Very attractive and meaningful.
Ship Shape: Ethereal boat heading out to sea -- a bit of a stretch. Odd looking.
Cloud Tower: Sorry but I find it ugly and too reminiscent of a cell phone tower.

- Though all 6 submissions are amazing, I was giddy when I seen the *FOUNTAIN* by FIGUREGROUND STUDIO. It makes me want to go down to the harbour and explore in and around the highs and lows of the structure, as a child would a fountain, bringing up nostalgia of playing around park fountains in Hamilton as a kid. I feel that flowing water is symbolic of Hamilton, with it's massive fountains in parks, waterfalls along the hiking trails, as well as the harbour itself, this feels like an appropriate addition to the location.
- I like *fountain*
- *Fountain* is my choice.
- *Fountain*. It is large and sculptural. As a result it will be seen and recognized from a distance. As well as captivating up close. Definitely something I can see people take picture of and in front of. Kids and adult can interact with it. The theme is appropriate being a central square.
- Figureground Studio's *Fountain* is my preference as it's the most dynamic of the pieces, with lots of movement. Like it in the white but would also be effective if it was in variegated tones of a colour such as turquoise or canary yellow.
- *Fountain* is best. I always wanted a big operating fountain in the harbour, but this would be less maintenance.
- I believe the *Fountain* is most appropriate for the site. Due to the size and simplicity of the structure, it will serve as a focal point along James Street and connect and draw people from the city to the water.
- Looks great
- Great fit for revitalized waterfront
- Great theme. Very imaginative. Striking!
- 1st choice – *Fountain*. Air, open, reaches the sky, stunning, breath of fresh air.
2nd choice – *Ship Shape*. Clean lines, open, great to walk there.
- 1st *Fountain* – excellent choice due to proximity to water. Very impressive.
2nd *Ship Shape*
- 1st *Fountain*
2nd *Ship Shape*
3rd *The Harbour Boat*

- 1st *Fountain* – It evokes the feeling of water. Can any water be added for effect eg. Holes in the pipes to allow water to pour out when pumped through.
2nd *Ship Shape* – very appropriate for a waterfront
- 1) *Fountain*
2) *Ship Shape*
3) *All Our Relations*
These are my choices 1) being most favored.
- I believe the *Fountain* delivers what a sculpture should. It is large and playful without obstructing views. However, I believe it would be nicer if it had a color and would actually spout water. Second choice, the *cloud*, although it reminds more of the exhaust from the steel factory than anything related to the climate of the great lakes. Maybe it should be black for that reason.
- I'm into *The Fountain* or *Ship Shape* as a 2nd choice.
Both are Contemporary and will elevate the area.
- It goes well with everything else that's already here. It's the best fit and beautiful and will make a cohesive space.
- This is inspiring. Most of the others are ugly. *All Our Relations* is my next choice.
- The *Fountain* looks great, looks to the future.
- Best of the Lot!
- Excellent design for location
- I like the *Fountain* because it connects the waterfront to the waterfall element of Hamilton. I also think it's the most dramatic and visible shape to be seen from a distance. I also like the interactive qualities. You can walk through it and around it.
- I like the *Fountain*. If you are looking for a beacon visible along James North and marks the entrance to West Harbour, this is it. It also well represents the connections you were looking for and appears to be modern enough for a brand new development like West Harbour.
- They are all interesting but my preference is FIGUREGROUND STUDIO because of the symbolism and scale which I think the project needs
- It represents the waves, industrial structures and mountains of the City.
- The best.

- Represents the future / past
- Nice simple fabulous design.
- I would like *Fountain Figureground Studio*, because it looks more attracted and looks no common then the other cities. Kids could have fun with that also.
- Good theme for waterfront!
- FIGUREGROUND STUDIO *Fountain*
- FIGUREGROUND STUDIO *Fountain*
- *Fountain* - it's beautiful and could be iconic
- Figureground Studios *Fountain*
- *Fountain* is the best...unobstructed views around it. Very beautiful.
- I think *FOUNTAIN* is the most spectacular sculpture for the location.
- I really like *Fountain*. It's a water element that brings joy and exuberance. It suits any season. Also- if the weather is really bad it won't be blown over or be a danger to those around it. Kids (and adults) will not be riding in it or on it.
- *Echo of the trumpeter* - are a bit underwhelming in the space. They are strange and whimsical, which I like, but the scale seems too small to be a beacon - like I see in the other projects. It looks a bit sad.
Harbour boat - I would be worried that this would burn down. If it was in cast aluminum, I would like it a lot more as a permanent sculpture!
All our relations - I love the idea, but find the structure of the artwork a bit boring. I wish the vertical 'frames' were different shapes (circles/ovals?) and connected to the artwork inside. Maybe even coloured poles would help.
Fountain - I love the scale and idea behind this project. It's sleek and it's easy to see the connection between the artwork and the water reference. I would love to see some connection to the ground - like drops of water imprinted in the concrete. This one is my favorite.
Ship Shape - seems eerie to me. I like the scale and material. I don't like the top point of the 'boats' it makes them look like sea creatures.
Cloud Tower - I like this one a lot. Great scale and it's fun. I like the materials. I wonder about how this will fit into the budget? It looks expensive to make. Dangerous climbing hazard? Looks like it wants to be climbed. A very close second choice for me.

- Here are my comments regarding the proposed public art sculpture, listed from least favourite to best.
 1. *Echo of the Trumpeter*: I feel this art work is too ironic and frankly too unusual for a public space. The scale is too small, and there is something kind of sad about this proposal. Imagine an abandoned pleasure boat beached on the shore.
 2. *The Harbour Boat*: I don't think the materials are going to hold up well outside and will be susceptible to vandalism and very difficult to fix later. The old boat metaphor doesn't resonate so well with me.
 3. *All our Relations*: I like the theme here a lot but find the appearance and resolution of the art not very successful. It looks like a sign board. It could be anywhere.
 4. *Two Smiths*: I don't get this proposal at all. See like an arbitrary form, but not a very pleasing one. Something creepy about the shapes.
 5. *Cloud Tower*: I like the idea here. Looks like the cloud form will be VERY expensive to build. Also, I worry it won't look like a cloud when built, but instead will be an aluminum blob. The tower structure looks like an invitation to climb as well.
 6. *Fountain*: This is probably the best choice. The allusion to water is good given the site. I think the scale is right, it will be visible from a distance and will be neat to walk underneath. Looks buildable. I wonder if the ground surface around the sculpture could also be treated in some way to complement the sculpture.
- I find "*Fountain*" to be the most delightful of the proposed art works. It has an inviting presence and sense of movement that I feel is lacking in the other static proposals. This form would draw children and adults alike into its structure for photographs and play.

***The Harbour Boat*, Artist: Ernest Daetwyler**

- Represents Hamilton's roll in shipping and the transport of goods through the great lakes all the way to Dundas and how water has connected communities and a hub of transportation over the century by water.
- I like it.
 - 1) I am a sailor (Albacore)
 - 2) Natural
 - 3) People can touch it – get in it.
- Don't want hard shapes.
- I believe each and every submission has true merit, making the choice difficult, and obviously subjective. My personal favorite is "*The Harbour Boat*" The possibility that these 2 mariners constructed their craft from items found nearby reminded me of the ingenuity of some of our industrial forefathers. I appreciate the City undertaking this sort of initiative, I think it proffers real value for the entire community. Thank-you.

- *The Harbour Boat* best reflects the projects goals and themes. It is a stunning piece and will suit the site like no other! It's beauty will nestle it into its surroundings and at first glance will almost appear to be an original part of the harbour itself.
- I'm particularly given to the organic nature of Daetwyler's proposal ... it feels as if it derives from the land which preceded the city, and as if it will subsume back into the land long before the city does. It feels like so often we forget that the passing nature of our presence in any place, and whilst the others too, will decay, they are designed with no truck to that truth.
- I think Ernest Daetwyler's submission clearly, yet artistically, represents the history and future of Hamilton's waterfront. I love that the boat is made from driftwood, a simple, natural product. I mean, who hasn't sat on a beach, looked at a piece of driftwood, and wondered and imagined where it came from and what it has all been through (past and present). It sparks the imagination of people gathering the driftwood together (unity). The Harbour Boat is an inspiring, creative and timeless masterpiece that will initiate conversation and reflection on where we have been and where we are going. Simply stunning.
- My choice is *Harbor Boat* by Ernest Daetwyler. It's beautiful, evocative and will be appreciated by a wide audience.
- *The Harbour Boat*
- *The Harbor*
- I think the *harbour boat* is the best realization of the themes that were proposed by the competition.
- *The Harbour Boat* would be my project of choice.
- I think the boat in bronze creates a great tension between driftwood and the long lasting material of bronze.
- *The Harbour Boat*
- ERNEST DAETWYLER *The Harbour Boat*.
- *The Harbour Boat*
- By far the most significant. Too many line proposals. This has significant presence.
- *The Harbour Boat* - I suspect I may be a traditionalist. My second choice is *Ship Shape*.

- *Harbour Boat* – 3 votes
 - History
 - Visually appealing
 - Want to know more about
- *Ship Shape* – 1 vote
 - Steel City
 - Visually appealing
 - A waterfront attraction
- I like the *Harbour Boat* best out of all the submissions. The rendering shown is very evocative and unique, especially the way it uses driftwood cast in bronze. It is a beautiful but kind of rough-hewn looking depiction of how we connect to the water. My second choice is the *Cloud Tower*. I appreciate the messaging behind the sculpture. I find the other submissions much too common looking. I could swear I've seen them - or something awfully similar- somewhere else. Hamilton is like no tiger city and should have landmark to reflect that.
- #1 Choice: Ernest Daetwyler *The Harbour Boat*
#2 Choice: Nicholas Chrombach *Echo of the Trumpeter*
- My 1st is the *Harbour Boat* as it signifies shipping, driftwood and the history of ship traffic in the area.
My 2nd is *All Our Relations* as it teaches many things about this area and I find it beautiful.
My 3rd is *Echo of the Trumpeter* as the bird is so prevalent in the region. I feel though, that it is diminished as an art piece by the connection to peddle boats.
- Love *The Harbour Boat*. Second choice would be *Ship Shape* but not hollow. Garbage will collect in the crevices – solid sides!
- *The Harbour Boat* looks classy and timeless as well as representing Hamilton Harbour well. It will be recognizable but not garish or out-of-date in 10 years like many of the other proposals.
- *Harbour Boat's* mast and sail very visible. Shipping is a large part of Hamilton Harbour. Sailing, fishing in the early days when my parents swam across the bay for fun. It looks cool, like an early Viking ship.
- *The Harbour Boat*
- I think the use of wood and its relationship with industry of boats and ships best represents the criteria. It brings images of historical boats and history of the harbour. The shape makes me think of indigenous canoes and the masts of large ships. They come together as a celebration of both.

- The *boat* reflects all Hamilton's past and future people's who chose this port as their hometown! From the past French who bargained with the native Indians (canoe) the English via ship's of sail! Chose the harbour as a great place to lay anchor and build a stable port of goods! "and nation". Hamilton is a port town the ship is a great "Focal Point" for a now very busy "port of call"!
- *The Harbour Boat* looks quite natural and unique. It gives me the feeling of relax by the water. The boat is very creative and natural. Shows people a caring Hamilton where there are many waterfalls. Very earthy and welcoming. Feeling of being natural and welcoming. Uniquely designed boat. Almost like Noahs Ark.
- Combines history, art and inspiration
- "Love it "
- I walk and cycle the waterfront regularly. I am drawn to it by the water, but also the trees. I walk the mountain brow regularly. On the brow I see Lake Ontario in the distance, city scape, trees. At the edge of the waterfront, everything water, boats, trees are so much more immediate. *The Harbour Boat* is the first thing I noticed upon entering Williams upper level. *The Harbour Boat* actually drew me to the table where I then inspected the other proposals. Thinking on it *The Harbour Boat* best embodies how I think of the waterfront. Boats move people and goods and I often think of indigenous peoples and settlers using boats. I love the natural look of the boat and feel its impact, even this version that sits upon a table. How impressive.
- I choose *The Harbour Boat* because it represents the immigrants that came to this City on the boats and made this City what it is today!
- The Ernest Daetwyler piece resonates most because it represents both the use of the waterfront and a natural connection to the land. In a space that is also relatively low on natural landscaping, having trees and sticks as part of the piece make a connection to the water.
- The *Harbour Boat* by Ernest Daetwyler best addresses the thematic goals of this Call for Public Art. The materials are sourced from the water and reflect the natural history of the area. These materials are then creatively used in a very artful way to construct a structure that reflects local sailing and shipping, to illustrate both leisure and economic aspects of the harbour, our history and the future / potential of the Harbourfront. The piece will create an elegant silhouette, regardless of which direction a photo is taken (with the Waterfront as its backdrop or looking south with the City behind). It is also dynamic, if visitors can touch and feel the piece and even climb inside.

Ship Shape, Artist: Two Smiths

- *Ship Shape*
- I feel this design is most aesthetically pleasing. It is not heavy or cumbersome. I think the explanation in the proposal booklet is very accurate and allows the public to interpret this art from several different viewpoints therefore appealing to a large group of people. I see a clear nautical connection. We do not need examples of more rusty steel structures in Hamilton. This submission offers grace, class and a definite sense of merging and complimenting the harbour shoreline.
- Best captures the industrial heritage of the City. Modern design but also relatable and recognizable, accessible. The material and design will both sustain as it ages and will create more interest in its material character as opposed to looking dilapidated and in need of repair.
- Very elegant. Beautiful negative space.
- Love the shape and that you can walk through it.
- Ship-related. Does not look easily climbable like some of the others (re: lawsuit potential)
- This choice *SHIP SHAPE* meets all goals and themes and is lovely. Visible from various locations – allows various interpretations. Is approachable, signifies connection to both water and the steel industry. Both being integral in Hamilton's history.
- It fits the theme with the current work around the piers already. Love all the options, but landed on Two Smiths.
- *Ship Shape*
- I think this one would make interesting sounds in the wind. It has movement and life from every angle. I can see children banging on the 'bases' to see if they can make some noise. It is multi-directional, good sight lines from every direction. Best all-round design.
- It was a difficult choice. Very interesting display.
- *Ship Shape*
- *Ship Shape*

- I very much enjoy the curved lines, the ribs of the "*ship shape*." It is elegant. The sculpture looks delicate (being tall) and despite being obviously large, it is aesthetically pleasing. This piece doesn't block the harbour view, the world can literally and figuratively be seen through the ship. The work is not only creative but engineered and thoughtfully planned in the contexts of the physical & social environment and Hamilton's history. This rendition is a pleasure to look at and sparked my imagination. The work embraces beautiful concepts and carries an imaginative story (the ethereal ships connection to the water/ great lakes and Canada's history) as well as embracing geometry and science (the passage of time as the earth orbits the sun relating to navigation). It is a brilliant piece!
- I like *Ship Shape* because of the scale it presents viewed from afar and the intimacy of interaction it provides to pedestrians up close. The connection to shopping is important to the City of Hamilton.
- My selection is *Ship Shape*.
It is big enough to make a statement from a distance as well as being very unique and distinctive. I have done a lot of travelling and haven't seen anything like this. Many cities have a sculpture unique to them and this could be Hamilton's. It's bold, and reflects the city's connection to the water as well as having a natural organic shape, giving it a connection to nature. The material used (looking like steel??) would probably be more sustainable than the driftwood boat, for example as well as providing another connection to the city.
It's a no brainer for me. Hands down.
- We vote for *Ship Shape* by Two Smiths. It is a lovely piece, and the artists have thought about the implications of their art in a public installation.
- *Echo of Trumpeter* reminds me of the swan boat rides at Centre Island.
Harbour Boat makes me think it won't last through one storm.
All Our Relations is just a bunch of billboards.
Fountain is similar to so many installations everywhere.
Ship Shape is by far my favourite. it reaches hopefully upward, and outward, while reflecting the fluidity of the water. I vote for this one.
Cloud Tower is just another steel tower, and we already have lots of those in Hamilton.
- I think "*Ship Shape*" by Two Smiths best reflects the project goals and themes. I appreciate the evocation of the boat form in a broad sense - from Haudenosaunee usage as a canoe landing (James St./Hwy 6 was originally was a portage route from the harbour to the Grand River!), as well as evoking the more recent industrial shipping history of the harbour. I also think that it allows for the best engagement for viewers - you can wander through casually or purposefully equally well, and its scale invites some level of engagement from many distances and angles. The sculpture has a landmark quality to it without being dominating. This is a sculpture that I would be thrilled to visit! A nice counterpoint also with the nearby "*Rafaga Unleashed*".

- *Ship Shape* gets my vote, great reflection of the context of the space, the hustle and bustle of the area, movement and fluidity in all directions. The animation and size will also see people interact with installation. Also modern and sleek interpretation.
- I would like to vote for the Two Smiths, "*Ship Shape*" art installation. It's experiential in the way people are able to move through the pieces of the sculpture, it's interpretive, it recognizes Hamilton's roots as it will be built from steel and it's boat-like shape further recognizes the role played by the harbour in building our city. Additionally, it's flowing curves and overall appearance provide a modern look while the entire art installation gives recognition to Hamilton's vibrant and growing arts culture. "*Ship Shape*" successfully incorporates the past, present and future of Hamilton.
- *Ship Shape* by Two Smiths best reflects the project's goals and themes because of its scale/size and the way perspective shifts back and forth between nature (wave), transportation (ship/sail) and industry (abstract steel) as you approach, and interact with the piece. It is large enough to be seen from a distance and is interesting regardless of the direction from which you approach it. It entices visitors to enter within its spaces, immersing you in the experience of being in/on the water, surrounded by waves and sails, either or both. It is a lovely bridge transitioning the visitor from the physical land to the water of the harbour.
- *Ship Shape*, Two Smiths. A piece of art that is very appealing to the eye, sleek, curved, artistic, and reminiscent of sails on the water. Peaceful. It will be seen from a distance (even from the mountain brow and the North Shore across the Bay) and draw people to the area. It will show off the growing reputation of beautiful art in Hamilton, and emphasize the waterfront's early history. Hamiltonians would be very proud to show off this attractive art installation to visitors to the city.
- *Ship Shape* has this emotional connection to the Air, Land and Sea. I see giant images of the sculpture as representational of how small humans are in the big scope of things. It's a thoughtful piece.
- I'd like to vote for *Ship Shape*. There are other nice submissions but none as powerful as *Ship Shape*. The installation's majestic and appealing wavy shape says to me:
 "You've reached the harbour. Welcome."
 "There's history here."
 "This is where land meets sea."
 "Ships, ships, ships."
 I think it's perfect and timeless for Hamilton.
- At first glance at the 6 proposed designs, *Ship Shape* caught my eye right away. This sculpture makes the viewer stop and wonder before it's simplistic yet a powerful representation of a hull of a ship emerges, almost as if it is rising from the sea. It really ties land and sea in a very unique way. I love that this piece of art changes depending on where you are standing and encourages visitors to walk through and be a part of the installation.

Ship Shape's interactive qualities allows visitors to use their imagination, yet also leads visitors to connect and learn about the history of the area.

- I think the *Ship Shape* submission from Two Smiths is the best. It is graceful, and can be interpreted in so many ways. I see a ship, and waves, and a group of people. It is strong and ethereal at the same time.
- *Two Smiths* by far reps Hamilton harbour the best
- I preferred the *ship shape* design as it fits with the unique of that part of the city. That is when I think of this area, I think sailboats and it ties into the swans. It is also unique enough where people's eyes will gravitate to it and not be taken for granted in the future. I do not like *cloud tower* as it has nothing to do with the area, not sure why its a finalist. 2nd choice is either *Echo of the Trumpeter* or *All our Relations* also symbolic of the hood. I think the *harbour boat* is not as grand and we have that symbol in the playground. Similar to the *cloud tower* the *Fountain* does not relate to the hood.
- By process of elimination: I believe that "*Trumpeter*" and "*The Boat*" are far too small in scale and too representational to have an appropriate impact, and should not be considered. "*All our Relations*" is interesting in content but static in nature as an art installation. "*Cloud Tower*" is of an appropriate scale but the assertion that cumulus clouds are somehow specific to Hamilton and the Great Lakes is somewhat irrelevant. Formally I find the design somewhat clunky and inelegant. The remaining two submissions "*Fountain*" and "*Ship Shape*" in my opinion are the most appropriate. They are volumetrically the most appropriate for the space. Of the two, I find *SHIP SHAPE* to be my favorite. It interacts with the ground in a way that will be meaningful to pedestrians. The other offers small scale interactions with the ground that could pose a safety concern. Pedestrians may walk into these small scale poles if not perceived in their peripheral vision. *SHIP SHAPE* is an elegant, unique, ephemeral, and appropriate art installation for this location.
- Modern perception of an old Viking ship. Low maintenance and durable.
- This piece has connected many of the themes inside the competition criteria, in a simple and elegant way. It draws attention to the history of the First Nations peoples on whose land we still live, as well as many of the geological and industrial elements of Hamilton's history. I also appreciate the many ways this piece can be interpreted, and the dynamic way it also is interactive as a sundial.
- I think *Ship Shape* by Two Smiths would suit the space best. It celebrates the harbour's past and looks to the future with it's timeless boat hull shape. It's an eye catching design that is sure to draw people in.
- do like the Two Smiths *Ship Sail*.

- 1- The *Ship* has connection to the harbour and has an ancient / historical look.
2- *Cloud Tower* is beautiful / innovative.
- *Ship Shape*. I would like to see this money helping the mentally ill people that roam around downtown though.
- *Ship Shape*
- *Ship Shape*
- *Ship Shape*
- Two Smiths *Ship shape* both works as signifying water and as modern art
Re-defining Hamilton in a modern world
- My preferred choice is the art called '*ship shape*' - its interesting, unusual, graceful, very pleasing to the eye and reflects innovation. It hints at the shape of a boat and fits the scale of the building behind it.
A couple of other options lacked innovation (see *fountain, all our relations*).
Cloud storms is just asking for trouble in a world with increased violent weather and frankly a little boring and is less likely to be appreciated since we don't spend our times looking up. If you wanted a 2nd choice it would be *the boat* but I think it would be better suited in a more natural environment. It reminds me of past art projects at the RBG
- Two Smiths. pick it.
- When I saw the photos of the proposals my eyes were immediately drawn to 2
Figureground Studio's "*Fountain*" and Two Smiths' "*Ship Shape*".
I love both the scale and the simplicity of these sculptures. I feel they would also lend a great background for those "Instagram" selfie seekers.
My first choice would be *Ship Shape* because of the movement of the piece and the visual of sailboats in the marina. A perfect, elegant choice.

None of the Above / Multiple Selections

- The *Harbour Boat* is reflective of the harbour and its uses. It has an ancient feel to it which reflects a history beyond Europeans.
Ship Shape is sophisticated and sleek. I love the outline of the ribs; like an old boat.
Echo of the Trumpeter – awful
Fountain – not a fit
Cloud Tower – weird

- People can sit on these or kids can climb them (*Echo* and *Harbour Boat*). Unique yet still functional.
Fountain is pleasing looking though.
- We need something Large so either Two Smiths *Ship Shape* or *Fountain*.
- *Ship Shape* and *Fountain*. We need a large object that can be seen from a distance. Either of my choices would be wonderful.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, The Harbour Boat, Fountain*
- *Fountain* – Clean lines
Ship Shape – works symbolically
- Why don't you put / build displays that have "greenery" (grass, trees) in it. We live in an urban jungle of concrete – these displays require huge amounts of cement / etc. devoid of real nature. It's "fake nature" – People in cities need more green space – its better for health and relaxation. Also some quiet spots where one can get away from the city noise. *All Our Relations* and *The Harbour Boat* are okay.
- *The Harbour Boat* – maybe
Cloud Tower – maybe
- *Fountain* and *Ship Shape*
- *Cloud Tower* and *Ship Shape*
I think that the cloud tower gives the best interpretation of what one aspires to do when taking a walk down to the Hamilton Harbour.
A walk to the harbour is characterized by a state of deep contemplation, a contemplation where one may think that they have lost themselves in a foggy mist. A foggy mist that is found amongst the clouds that one sees being swallowed up by the horizon when viewing the sunset at Hamilton Harbour.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, The Harbour Boat* and *All Our Relations*
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, The Harbour Boat, All Our Relations, Ship Shape*
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, The Harbour Boat* and *All Our Relations*
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, The Harbour Boat* and *Ship Shape*
- *All Our Relations* and *Fountain* – both designs are welcoming and fun to look at. Great inspiring creations. Well Done!

- *Fountain* and *Ship Shape*
- I picked *The Harbour Boat* because I think it represents the harbour and Hamilton as a whole. Our home is a lot of water and our harbour and docks have a huge impact on the economy.
I also picked the *Fountain*. I love the style and size of it. It is a very nice piece of Art and that also reflects on our City.
They all are beautiful pieces of Art. Great work to all of the Artist's. These are amazing!
- *All our Relations* seems to tell a story that brought people together of all ethnicities while secondly the Waterfall is a beautiful piece of art that all would come to see.
- Honestly most of these are really terrible. Is this the best Hamilton artists could do?
- I'm not a resident but rather a frequent day tripper to Hamilton.
The *fountain* and the *swans* are my choices. You enter them; it is engaging more so than the display pieces.
The *ship* is too conceptual to touch the hearts of passersby. The *cloud tower* is the wrong scale; pedestrians mostly see the footings. The *boat* may have appeal to children.
- It is not common for me to submit a commentary but thought I would in this case. It is such an important area - Hamilton Waterfront - and I spend a lot of my free time there - and having a sculpture marking the entrance from James St. North and being an appropriate signifier for the area. Congratulations on some really great submissions and shortlist. I feel less strongly about the *Cloudtower*, *Figureground Studio* - perhaps *Cloudtower* is too reminiscent of male phallic like sculptures for me :) although I get the meaning; and the *Figureground Studio* reminds me of a more utilitarian piece. *Echo of the Trumpeter* would be very popular and enticing for many segments of the population and *Ship Shape* I liked for its ethereal approach. I felt that both, although good, may not have embraced the relationships of water, natural, and industrial. I am most drawn to the rustic nature of *Harbourboat* and its symbolism as well as the work *All Our Relations*. Both possess a strong human element to them - setting up a relationship and seem to actively engage the physical body with the work in a more meaningful way. At a time like now - with environment, land, industrial versus nature - the relationships that *All our Relations* refer to in history and time is so relevant. Good luck! I loved looking at these works.
- I don't like the work by *NICHOLAS CROMBACH* at all, looks very corny and cheesy to me. Surprised it even got shortlisted. The boat by *ERNEST DAETWYLER* is striking and appealing, I like it. *ANGELA DEMONTIGNY*'s work is light and spacious, and gives a good feeling of ease and comfort. *Figureground studio* and *two smiths* are too industrial and generally feel oppressive. Of the two, I like *figureground studio* more. *BRANDON VICKERD*'s work is industrial and ugly. Reminds me of a water tower, an eye sore, something that should be demolished and replaced with something better and definitely not constructed.

- *Fountain* and *cloud tower* are equally fitting for this site. They are both whimsical but modern and industrial.
- The *Harbour Boat* will be the most interactive, but it is also the most obvious. *The Cloud* is the most interesting of the proposals
- Cloud Tower - beautiful idea. The only thing I find a bit off putting is the height but I understand the concept of it being a beacon almost.
All Our Relations - represents many different aspects of Hamilton, a very diverse city with a rich history. Beautiful artwork depicting meaningful messages, love it!!
- Absolutely love *All Our Relations* and *Echo of the Trumpeter*. Both are artistic, beautiful, and different. Everyone has done a wonderful job but these 2 stand out to me as being the most unique.
- Check AODA guidelines for all works- *Swan* and *fountain* are problematic. Verify budgets- *All our relations* is pretty large scale in a windy area and could function like a sail without substantial structure. I always like *Brandon Vickard*. *Daetwyler* looks too much like Peter von Tiesenhausen for my comfort. Plus if people climb around it they can get their feet stuck (Coupland Beaver Dam in Toronto was eventually removed for that reason, plus problems with vandalism as folks tried to take home pieces of it.). *Ship Shape* looks a bit too commercial for my taste.
- I really like the submission by the Two Smiths "*Ship Shape*" good name, strong portrayal of a ship, industry, recreation. I feel this work meets all of your criteria better than some of the other submissions.
The other one of interest is the work by *Angela Demontigny*.
- I like *Echo of the Trumpeter* and *All Our Relations*
Are there other submissions that could also act as sunshade?? Perhaps artists could have incorporated providing shade into their pieces.
- I am in favour of both *All Our Relations* and *the Harbour Boat*. The former contributed to the re-connection of water and the land to the indigenous people. I appreciate how it highlights the history of and current abundance of species in this, most bio-diverse area in Canada. I also think it is important to bring back the spiritual connection to nature especially to the water and the life it supports.
The Harbour Boat should be considered for its use in natural materials and its connection to the history of human settlement and change in land use over time.
- All very nice proposals! My preferences are '*all our relations*' and '*the harbour boat*', for the way I think passerby will interact with them.

- *Echo of the Trumpeter*: Feels like junk left around. Not flattering to the space, not tall enough.
The Harbour Boat: Looks nice, appropriate height. Bronze doesn't rust. Provides seating. Remove art from one place to put it in another? Sad, but favorite.
All Our Relations: Shopping mall art.
Fountain: Best use of space, visible height, demands exploration & views from different angles. Increases engagement/participation by reaching over the waterfront path and into the steps. Reminds me of Gore Park fountain. Health effects of spray coating? Favorite.
Ship Shape: Most elegant form. Appears to offer seating, doesn't. Great craftsmanship, stainless can rust if the right kind of stainless isn't used. Favorite.
Cloud Tower: eyesore waiting to happen.
- Sorry, but I have comments on three of the proposals. I find that *All My Relations* has a wonderful big-picture reference to nature's interconnection, that goes way beyond just humans and water. I wish there was a bit more description of how the piece will be made. It seems like it emulates beading? That's a nice idea and likely nicely complex to look at. I find *The Harbour Boat* most aesthetically pleasing. Since the area will already be pretty full of buildings and geometric shapes, and it's very organic. The idea spans different times and cultures nicely, as it doesn't reference any type of boat directly. *Echo the Trumpeter* is a great idea - how awesome swans have come back from near-extinction and live here. Also the boat-swan visual is intriguing. I also like to imagine people playing in and around the sculptures and *The boat and swans* seem to have this strength. Hope that helps...sorry I can't choose one :) i don't like the one with the *tower and cloud* - it feels oppressive.
- I very much regret having to make this comment, but I fail to identify any of the models presented as being satisfactory. The *Fountain* is derivative, a poor version of the outstanding sail sculpture existing.
The coloured globes on an arc are mundane and meaningless.
The *Cloud Tower* means ?? to me
Enough! ½ for *Ship Shape*. ½ for *The Harbour Boat* or try some more. Open the contest again!
- I've lived in the North End for 35 years. I know this area well and I don't think any of these are very good.
- *All Our Relations* and *Fountain*
- None
- *All Our Relations* and *Fountain*
- *Ship Shape* and *Fountain* are the only ones that really stands out to me as a significant piece of engaging public art. Both pieces define space, and allow for the experience of the piece from multiple vantage points. The meaning behind both is also relevant to the locale.

- I enjoy the many facets of all these panels and how they all connect, Lots to see and feel. Definitely the best!
- Do not like any of these. Can't we have something that speaks more to the history of the piers?
- My favourite are *Ship shape* and *the fountain!*
- *All Our Relations* and *The Harbour Boat*. I think that the glass things are cool and they represent our country in many difference ways and it represents that we have many different animals in and out of the water. It also has some different ways it represents our different cultures.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, Fountain and Ship Shape*. The two I chose I did because they are cool looking, modern artwork.
- *None*. I like old fashioned real art.
- *Echo of the Trumpeter, All Our Relations, The Harbour Boat*
- I appreciate either *the Harbour Boat* or *All our Relations*. They celebrate a component of history that should be remembered.
I particularly like the interactive component of the driftwood boat concept. It is more playful and celebrates the boating community.
- I am a home owner in the north end and think the *all our relations* and *harbour boat* are the two nicest. It's important for indigenous people to feel welcome in our neighbourhood and our city. The *all our relations* piece is not only beautiful but also a great way to pay respect. Whatever you do don't put that *cloud tower* thing in front of my house.